

Claim: $\langle \cdot, \cdot \rangle$ is non-degenerate on Z . That is, if z in Z , and

$$\langle z, z_{\text{star}} \rangle = 0$$

for all z_{star} in Z , then $z=0$.

```
ConstraintsZ = {};

(*
 * Z and Zstar are antisymmetric in upper and lower indices.
 * Let us therefore always represent them in normal forms.
 *)
ZN[a_, b_, i_, j_] :=
  Signature[{a, b}] Signature[{i, j}] z[Min[{a, b}], Max[{a, b}], Min[{i, j}], Max[{i, j}]]
ZstarN[a_, b_, i_, j_] := Signature[{a, b}] Signature[{i, j}]
zstar[Min[{a, b}], Max[{a, b}], Min[{i, j}], Max[{i, j}]]
```

- Notation:

ZN[i,j,k,l] = valid for all indices i,j,k,l
z[i,j,k,l] = only defined for i<j and k<l

ZstarN[i,j,k,l] and **zstar** are related similarly.

Above ij are upper indices, and kl are lower indices.

- In this notebook, trace means the first trace where only the latter index is contracted.

- Define modules for later use:

```

(*
Zero out all components of zstar[i,j,k,l].
*)
ZeroZstar[] :=
Module[{i, j, a, b},
For[i = 1, i ≤ 4, i++,
For[j = i + 1, j ≤ 4, j++,
For[a = 1, a ≤ 4, a++,
For[b = a + 1, b ≤ 4, b++,
zstar[i, j, a, b] = 0;
];
];
];
];
]

(*
Compute <z,Zstar>.
Note that z[i,j,k,l] and zstar[i,j,k,l] are global variables.
The result is a scalar.
*)
ComputeInnerProduct[] :=
Module[{},
Simplify[Sum[
ZN[p, q, l, m] ZstarN[l, m, p, q],
{p, 1, 4}, {q, 1, 4}, {l, 1, 4}, {m, 1, 4}
],
ConstraintsZ]
]

(*
* 1. check that Zstar has zero trace, so that Zstar is in subspace Z.
* 2. Compute inner product <z,Zstar> which by assumption is zero, and
*     add this constraint to ConstraintsZ if it is not yet in the list.
*
*)
CheckZstar[] := Module[
{temp, HasZeroTrace, InnProd, NewConstraint, i, j},
temp = {};
```

```

(* Check that Zstar has zero trace. There are four conditions. *)
HasZeroTrace = True;
For[i = 1, i ≤ 4, i++,
  For[j = 1, j ≤ 4, j++,
    sum = Sum[ZstarN[i, P, j, P], {P, 1, 4}];
    temp = Append[temp, sum];
    If [Simplify[sum] == 0,
      (* trace zero, do nothing *),
      HasZeroTrace = False];
  ];
];
];

If[HasZeroTrace == False,
  Print["Zstar does not have zero trace. Check input."];
  Print[temp];
  Return[];
];

Print["Zstar has zero trace -- OK"];

(* Check that inner product <Z,Zstar> is not zero *)
InnProd = ComputeInnerProduct[];
Print["<Z,Zstar>=", InnProd];

If[InnProd == 0,
  Print["Constraint is not new."];
  Return[];
];

(* We use Simplify[...] to factor away any leading constant
*)
NewConstraint = Simplify[InnProd == 0];
Print["Adding constraint: ", NewConstraint];
Print[""];
ConstraintsZ = Append[ConstraintsZ, NewConstraint];
];
]

```

Start to build up constraints on Z

- Let us first write out the constraints on Zstar so that we can find suitable Zstar to plug into $\langle Z, Zstar \rangle = 0$. With suitable Zstar this will give enough constraints on Z to deduce that Z=0.

```

Constraints = {};
For[i = 1, i ≤ 4, i++,
  For[j = 1, j ≤ 4, j++,
    Constraints = Append[Constraints,
      0 ==
      Sum[
        ZstarN[i, P, j, P], {P, 1, 4}]
    ];
];
];
Constraints // MatrixForm

```

```
( 0 == zstar[1, 2, 1, 2] + zstar[1, 3, 1, 3] + zstar[1, 4, 1, 4] )
  0 == zstar[1, 3, 2, 3] + zstar[1, 4, 2, 4]
  0 == -zstar[1, 2, 2, 3] + zstar[1, 4, 3, 4]
  0 == -zstar[1, 2, 2, 4] - zstar[1, 3, 3, 4]
  0 == zstar[2, 3, 1, 3] + zstar[2, 4, 1, 4]
0 == zstar[1, 2, 1, 2] + zstar[2, 3, 2, 3] + zstar[2, 4, 2, 4]
  0 == zstar[1, 2, 1, 3] + zstar[2, 4, 3, 4]
  0 == zstar[1, 2, 1, 4] - zstar[2, 3, 3, 4]
  0 == -zstar[2, 3, 1, 2] + zstar[3, 4, 1, 4]
  0 == zstar[1, 3, 1, 2] + zstar[3, 4, 2, 4]
0 == zstar[1, 3, 1, 3] + zstar[2, 3, 2, 3] + zstar[3, 4, 3, 4]
  0 == zstar[1, 3, 1, 4] + zstar[2, 3, 2, 4]
  0 == -zstar[2, 4, 1, 2] - zstar[3, 4, 1, 3]
  0 == zstar[1, 4, 1, 2] - zstar[3, 4, 2, 3]
  0 == zstar[1, 4, 1, 3] + zstar[2, 4, 2, 3]
0 == zstar[1, 4, 1, 4] + zstar[2, 4, 2, 4] + zstar[3, 4, 3, 4]
```

First apply 12 constraints that contain only two terms:

```

(* 0==zstar[1,3,2,3]+zstar[1,4,2,4] *)
ZeroZstar[];
zstar[1, 3, 2, 3] = 1; zstar[1, 4, 2, 4] = -1;
CheckZstar[]
(* 0==zstar[1,2,2,3]+zstar[1,4,3,4] *)
ZeroZstar[];
zstar[1, 2, 2, 3] = 1; zstar[1, 4, 3, 4] = 1;
CheckZstar[]
(* 0==zstar[1,2,2,4]-zstar[1,3,3,4] *)
ZeroZstar[];
zstar[1, 2, 2, 4] = 1; zstar[1, 3, 3, 4] = -1;
CheckZstar[]
(*0==zstar[2,3,1,3]+zstar[2,4,1,4]*)
ZeroZstar[];
zstar[2, 3, 1, 3] = 1; zstar[2, 4, 1, 4] = -1;
CheckZstar[]
(* 0==zstar[1,2,1,3]+zstar[2,4,3,4] *)
ZeroZstar[];
zstar[1, 2, 1, 3] = 1; zstar[2, 4, 3, 4] = -1;
CheckZstar[]
(*0==zstar[1,2,1,4]-zstar[2,3,3,4]*)
ZeroZstar[];
zstar[1, 2, 1, 4] = 1; zstar[2, 3, 3, 4] = 1;
CheckZstar[]
(*0==zstar[2,3,1,2]+zstar[3,4,1,4]*)
ZeroZstar[];
zstar[2, 3, 1, 2] = 1; zstar[3, 4, 1, 4] = 1;
CheckZstar[]
(* 0==zstar[1,3,1,2]+zstar[3,4,2,4] *)
ZeroZstar[];
zstar[1, 3, 1, 2] = 1; zstar[3, 4, 2, 4] = -1;
CheckZstar[]
(* 0==zstar[1,3,1,4]+zstar[2,3,2,4] *)
ZeroZstar[];
zstar[1, 3, 1, 4] = 1; zstar[2, 3, 2, 4] = -1;
CheckZstar[]
(* 0==zstar[2,4,1,2]-zstar[3,4,1,3] *)
ZeroZstar[];
zstar[2, 4, 1, 2] = 1; zstar[3, 4, 1, 3] = -1;
CheckZstar[]
(* 0==zstar[1,4,1,2]-zstar[3,4,2,3] *)
ZeroZstar[];
zstar[1, 4, 1, 2] = 1; zstar[3, 4, 2, 3] = 1;
CheckZstar[]
(* 0==zstar[1,4,1,3]+zstar[2,4,2,3]*)
ZeroZstar[];
zstar[1, 4, 1, 3] = 1; zstar[2, 4, 2, 3] = -1;
CheckZstar[]

Zstar has zero trace -- OK

<Z,Zstar>=4 (z[2, 3, 1, 3] - z[2, 4, 1, 4])

Adding constraint: z[2, 3, 1, 3] == z[2, 4, 1, 4]

```

```

Zstar has zero trace -- OK

<Z,Zstar>=4 (z[2, 3, 1, 2] + z[3, 4, 1, 4])

Adding constraint: z[2, 3, 1, 2] + z[3, 4, 1, 4] == 0

```

```
Zstar has zero trace -- OK
```

```

<Z,Zstar>=4 (z[2, 4, 1, 2] - z[3, 4, 1, 3])
Adding constraint: z[2, 4, 1, 2] == z[3, 4, 1, 3]

Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 (z[1, 3, 2, 3] - z[1, 4, 2, 4])
Adding constraint: z[1, 3, 2, 3] == z[1, 4, 2, 4]

Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 (z[1, 3, 1, 2] - z[3, 4, 2, 4])
Adding constraint: z[1, 3, 1, 2] == z[3, 4, 2, 4]

Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 (z[1, 4, 1, 2] + z[3, 4, 2, 3])
Adding constraint: z[1, 4, 1, 2] + z[3, 4, 2, 3] == 0

Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 (z[1, 2, 2, 3] + z[1, 4, 3, 4])
Adding constraint: z[1, 2, 2, 3] + z[1, 4, 3, 4] == 0

Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 (z[1, 2, 1, 3] - z[2, 4, 3, 4])
Adding constraint: z[1, 2, 1, 3] == z[2, 4, 3, 4]

Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 (z[1, 4, 1, 3] - z[2, 4, 2, 3])
Adding constraint: z[1, 4, 1, 3] == z[2, 4, 2, 3]

Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 (z[1, 2, 2, 4] - z[1, 3, 3, 4])
Adding constraint: z[1, 2, 2, 4] == z[1, 3, 3, 4]

Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 (z[1, 2, 1, 4] + z[2, 3, 3, 4])
Adding constraint: z[1, 2, 1, 4] + z[2, 3, 3, 4] == 0

Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 (z[1, 3, 1, 4] - z[2, 3, 2, 4])

```

Adding constraint: $z[1, 3, 1, 4] = z[2, 3, 2, 4]$

- Next we study the four constraints that are involve 3 terms. Note that these are not independent since they contain common variables.
- The four constraints are

$$\begin{aligned} 0 &= zstar[1, 2, 1, 2] + zstar[1, 3, 1, 3] + zstar[1, 4, 1, 4] \\ 0 &= zstar[1, 2, 1, 2] + zstar[2, 3, 2, 3] + zstar[2, 4, 2, 4] \\ 0 &= zstar[1, 3, 1, 3] + zstar[2, 3, 2, 3] + zstar[3, 4, 3, 4] \\ 0 &= zstar[1, 4, 1, 4] + zstar[2, 4, 2, 4] + zstar[3, 4, 3, 4] \end{aligned}$$

and they can be written as

$$\begin{aligned} 0 &= AA + BB + CC \\ 0 &= AA + DD + EE \\ 0 &= BB + DD + FF \\ 0 &= CC + EE + FF \end{aligned}$$

```

ZeroZstar[];
zstar[1, 2, 1, 2] = AA; zstar[1, 3, 1, 3] = BB; zstar[1, 4, 1, 4] = CC;
zstar[2, 3, 2, 3] = DD; zstar[2, 4, 2, 4] = EE; zstar[3, 4, 3, 4] = FF;

Simplify[Sum[
  ZN[p, q, 1, m] ZstarN[1, m, p, q],
  {p, 1, 4}, {q, 1, 4}, {l, 1, 4}, {m, 1, 4}
], ConstraintsZ]

4 (AA z[1, 2, 1, 2] + BB z[1, 3, 1, 3] +
  CC z[1, 4, 1, 4] + DD z[2, 3, 2, 3] + EE z[2, 4, 2, 4] + FF z[3, 4, 3, 4])

Solve[{(
  AA + BB + CC == 0,
  AA + DD + EE == 0,
  BB + DD + FF == 0,
  CC + EE + FF == 0,
  BB - CC - DD + EE == 6,
  AA - CC - DD + FF == 0
), {AA, BB, CC, DD, EE, FF}}]
{{AA → -1, BB → 2, CC → -1, DD → -1, EE → 2, FF → -1} }

Solve[{(
  AA + BB + CC == 0,
  AA + DD + EE == 0,
  BB + DD + FF == 0,
  CC + EE + FF == 0,
  BB - CC - DD + EE == 0,
  AA - CC - DD + FF == 6
), {AA, BB, CC, DD, EE, FF}}]
{{AA → 2, BB → -1, CC → -1, DD → -1, EE → -1, FF → 2}}

```

- Based on this we make two substitutions:

```

ZeroZstar[];
zstar[1, 2, 1, 2] = -1; zstar[1, 3, 1, 3] = 2; zstar[1, 4, 1, 4] = -1;
zstar[2, 3, 2, 3] = -1; zstar[2, 4, 2, 4] = 2; zstar[3, 4, 3, 4] = -1;
CheckZstar[]

ZeroZstar[];
zstar[1, 2, 1, 2] = 2; zstar[1, 3, 1, 3] = -1; zstar[1, 4, 1, 4] = -1;
zstar[2, 3, 2, 3] = -1; zstar[2, 4, 2, 4] = -1; zstar[3, 4, 3, 4] = 2;
CheckZstar[]

Zstar has zero trace -- OK

<Z,Zstar>=
- 4 (z[1, 2, 1, 2] - 2 z[1, 3, 1, 3] + z[1, 4, 1, 4] + z[2, 3, 2, 3] - 2 z[2, 4, 2, 4] + z[3, 4, 3, 4])

Adding constraint:
z[1, 2, 1, 2] + z[1, 4, 1, 4] + z[2, 3, 2, 3] + z[3, 4, 3, 4] = 2 (z[1, 3, 1, 3] + z[2, 4, 2, 4])

Zstar has zero trace -- OK

<Z,Zstar>=12 (z[1, 3, 1, 3] - z[1, 4, 1, 4] - z[2, 3, 2, 3] + z[2, 4, 2, 4])

Adding constraint: z[1, 3, 1, 3] + z[2, 4, 2, 4] = z[1, 4, 1, 4] + z[2, 3, 2, 3]

```

- Next we make an observation: In trace Zstar[a,b,i,b] there are no terms where all indices are distinct. This gives (at most) 6 more constraints.

```

PList = Permutations[{1, 2, 3, 4}];
For [perm = 1, perm ≤ Length[PList], perm++,
  ppp = PList[[perm]][[1]];
  qqq = PList[[perm]][[2]];
  aaa = PList[[perm]][[3]];
  bbb = PList[[perm]][[4]];

  If [ppp < qqq && aaa < bbb,
    Print["Assuming zstar[", ppp, ", ", qqq, ", ", aaa, ", ", bbb, "]=1"];
    ZeroZstar[];
    zstar[ppp, qqq, aaa, bbb] = 1;
    CheckZstar[];
  ]
];
Assuming zstar[1,2,3,4]=1

Zstar has zero trace -- OK

<Z,Zstar>=4 z[3, 4, 1, 2]

Adding constraint: z[3, 4, 1, 2] == 0

Assuming zstar[1,3,2,4]=1

Zstar has zero trace -- OK

<Z,Zstar>=4 z[2, 4, 1, 3]

Adding constraint: z[2, 4, 1, 3] == 0

Assuming zstar[1,4,2,3]=1

```

```

Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[2, 3, 1, 4]
Adding constraint: z[2, 3, 1, 4] == 0

Assuming zstar[2,3,1,4]=1
Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[1, 4, 2, 3]
Adding constraint: z[1, 4, 2, 3] == 0

Assuming zstar[2,4,1,3]=1
Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[1, 3, 2, 4]
Adding constraint: z[1, 3, 2, 4] == 0

Assuming zstar[3,4,1,2]=1
Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[1, 2, 3, 4]
Adding constraint: z[1, 2, 3, 4] == 0

Assuming zstar[1,2,3,4]=1
Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[3, 4, 1, 2]
Adding constraint: z[3, 4, 1, 2] == 0

Assuming zstar[1,3,2,4]=1
Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[2, 4, 1, 3]
Adding constraint: z[2, 4, 1, 3] == 0

Assuming zstar[1,4,2,3]=1
Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[2, 3, 1, 4]
Adding constraint: z[2, 3, 1, 4] == 0

Assuming zstar[2,3,1,4]=1
Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[1, 4, 2, 3]
Adding constraint: z[1, 4, 2, 3] == 0

```

```
Assuming zstar[2,4,1,3]=1
Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[1, 3, 2, 4]
Adding constraint: z[1, 3, 2, 4] == 0
```

```
Assuming zstar[3,4,1,2]=1
Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[1, 2, 3, 4]
Adding constraint: z[1, 2, 3, 4] == 0
```

```
Assuming zstar[1,2,3,4]=1
Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[3, 4, 1, 2]
Adding constraint: z[3, 4, 1, 2] == 0
```

```
Assuming zstar[1,3,2,4]=1
Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[2, 4, 1, 3]
Adding constraint: z[2, 4, 1, 3] == 0
```

```
Assuming zstar[1,4,2,3]=1
Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[2, 3, 1, 4]
Adding constraint: z[2, 3, 1, 4] == 0
```

```
Assuming zstar[2,3,1,4]=1
Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[1, 4, 2, 3]
Adding constraint: z[1, 4, 2, 3] == 0
```

```
Assuming zstar[2,4,1,3]=1
Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[1, 3, 2, 4]
Adding constraint: z[1, 3, 2, 4] == 0
```

```
Assuming zstar[3,4,1,2]=1
```

```

Zstar has zero trace -- OK
<Z,Zstar>=4 z[1, 2, 3, 4]
Adding constraint: z[1, 2, 3, 4] == 0

```

```

ConstraintsZ
Length[ConstraintsZ]

{z[2, 3, 1, 3] == z[2, 4, 1, 4], z[2, 3, 1, 2] + z[3, 4, 1, 4] == 0, z[2, 4, 1, 2] == z[3, 4, 1, 3],
 z[1, 3, 2, 3] == z[1, 4, 2, 4], z[1, 3, 1, 2] == z[3, 4, 2, 4], z[1, 4, 1, 2] + z[3, 4, 2, 3] == 0,
 z[1, 2, 2, 3] + z[1, 4, 3, 4] == 0, z[1, 2, 1, 3] == z[2, 4, 3, 4], z[1, 4, 1, 3] == z[2, 4, 2, 3],
 z[1, 2, 2, 4] == z[1, 3, 3, 4], z[1, 2, 1, 4] + z[2, 3, 3, 4] == 0, z[1, 3, 1, 4] == z[2, 3, 2, 4],
 z[1, 2, 1, 2] + z[1, 4, 1, 4] + z[2, 3, 2, 3] + z[3, 4, 3, 4] == 2 (z[1, 3, 1, 3] + z[2, 4, 2, 4]),
 z[1, 3, 1, 3] + z[2, 4, 2, 4] == z[1, 4, 1, 4] + z[2, 3, 2, 3], z[3, 4, 1, 2] == 0,
 z[2, 4, 1, 3] == 0, z[2, 3, 1, 4] == 0, z[1, 4, 2, 3] == 0, z[1, 3, 2, 4] == 0, z[1, 2, 3, 4] == 0}

```

20

- Note: If z is in $Z_{\text{perp}} = \{ u \in \Omega^2 : \langle u, z \rangle = 0 \text{ for all } z \in Z \}$ then z satisfies the above constraints. We will use this observation in notebook UZperpSubsetW.

Last Step: We know that z belongs to Z , so add constraints for this.

- Since Z has zero trace we obtain the following constraints:

```

For[i = 1, i ≤ 4, i++,
  For[j = 1, j ≤ 4, j++,
    ConstraintsZ = Append[ConstraintsZ,
      0 == Sum[ZN[i, P, j, P], {P, 1, 4}]];
  ]
]
ConstraintsZ // MatrixForm

```

$\left. \begin{array}{l} z[2, 3, 1, 3] == z[2, 4, 1, 4] \\ z[2, 3, 1, 2] + z[3, 4, 1, 4] == 0 \\ z[2, 4, 1, 2] == z[3, 4, 1, 3] \\ z[1, 3, 2, 3] == z[1, 4, 2, 4] \\ z[1, 3, 1, 2] == z[3, 4, 2, 4] \\ z[1, 4, 1, 2] + z[3, 4, 2, 3] == 0 \\ z[1, 2, 2, 3] + z[1, 4, 3, 4] == 0 \\ z[1, 2, 1, 3] == z[2, 4, 3, 4] \\ z[1, 4, 1, 3] == z[2, 4, 2, 3] \\ z[1, 2, 2, 4] == z[1, 3, 3, 4] \\ z[1, 2, 1, 4] + z[2, 3, 3, 4] == 0 \\ z[1, 3, 1, 4] == z[2, 3, 2, 4] \\ z[1, 2, 1, 2] + z[1, 4, 1, 4] + z[2, 3, 2, 3] + z[3, 4, 3, 4] == 2(z[1, 3, 1, 3] + z[2, 4, 2, 4]) \\ z[1, 3, 1, 3] + z[2, 4, 2, 4] == z[1, 4, 1, 4] + z[2, 3, 2, 3] \\ z[3, 4, 1, 2] == 0 \\ z[2, 4, 1, 3] == 0 \\ z[2, 3, 1, 4] == 0 \\ z[1, 4, 2, 3] == 0 \\ z[1, 3, 2, 4] == 0 \\ z[1, 2, 3, 4] == 0 \\ 0 == z[1, 2, 1, 2] + z[1, 3, 1, 3] + z[1, 4, 1, 4] \\ 0 == z[1, 3, 2, 3] + z[1, 4, 2, 4] \\ 0 == -z[1, 2, 2, 3] + z[1, 4, 3, 4] \\ 0 == -z[1, 2, 2, 4] - z[1, 3, 3, 4] \\ 0 == z[2, 3, 1, 3] + z[2, 4, 1, 4] \\ 0 == z[1, 2, 1, 2] + z[2, 3, 2, 3] + z[2, 4, 2, 4] \\ 0 == z[1, 2, 1, 3] + z[2, 4, 3, 4] \\ 0 == z[1, 2, 1, 4] - z[2, 3, 3, 4] \\ 0 == -z[2, 3, 1, 2] + z[3, 4, 1, 4] \\ 0 == z[1, 3, 1, 2] + z[3, 4, 2, 4] \\ 0 == z[1, 3, 1, 3] + z[2, 3, 2, 3] + z[3, 4, 3, 4] \\ 0 == z[1, 3, 1, 4] + z[2, 3, 2, 4] \\ 0 == -z[2, 4, 1, 2] - z[3, 4, 1, 3] \\ 0 == z[1, 4, 1, 2] - z[3, 4, 2, 3] \\ 0 == z[1, 4, 1, 3] + z[2, 4, 2, 3] \\ 0 == z[1, 4, 1, 4] + z[2, 4, 2, 4] + z[3, 4, 3, 4] \end{array} \right)$

We now have enough constraints on z to show that $z=0$.